5-5-2014

Nitrogen Isotope Dynamics of Anammox and Denitrification in Coastal Groundwater

Nicole Chang

University of Connecticut - Avery Point, nicole.chang@uconn.edu

Recommended Citation

Nitrogen Isotope Dynamics of Anammox and Denitrification in Coastal Groundwater

Nicole Whi-tzen Chang

B.A., Duke University, 2010

A Thesis
Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree of
Master of Science
at the
University of Connecticut
2014
Master of the Science Thesis

Nitrogen Isotope Dynamics of Anammox and Denitrification in Coastal Groundwater

Presented by
Nicole Whi-tzen Chang, B.A.

Major Advisor  
Craig R. Tobias

Associate Advisor  
Julie Granger

Associate Advisor  
Penny Vlahos

University of Connecticut

2014
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my deepest appreciation and gratitude to my advisor Dr. Craig Tobias, without whom I could not have attained this achievement. Thank you for all the knowledge, aid, advice, editing, and patience you have given for the past two and a half years. I would also like to thank my committee members, Dr. Penny Vlahos and Dr. Julie Granger, for their help and occasional usage of their labs. Thank you to our colleagues at the U.S. Geological Survey, through field work, snow, shotgun hunting season, and government shutdowns, for both analytical work and use of facilities and equipment during the countless trips to the Cape. Finally, thank you to Dave Cady and Claudia Koerting for all of their help during lab analyses, Kevin Brown for modeling, those of the night crew, and all my family, friends, and fellow labmates for their support.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES ........................................................................................................ vi
LIST OF FIGURES ....................................................................................................... vii
ABSTRACT ................................................................................................................... viii
INTRODUCTION ......................................................................................................... 10
MATERIALS AND METHODS .................................................................................... 17
  Study Site ................................................................................................................. 17
  Experimental Approach .......................................................................................... 21
    Natural Abundance Incubations ............................................................................. 21
    Tracer Incubations .................................................................................................. 22
  Analytical Methods .................................................................................................. 23
  Data Synthesis .......................................................................................................... 24
    Natural Abundance ................................................................................................. 24
    Tracer ..................................................................................................................... 27
RESULTS ..................................................................................................................... 28
  Natural Abundance Fractionation Experiments ....................................................... 28
    Upgradient F575 Site ............................................................................................. 28
    Downgradient F168 Site .......................................................................................... 33
  Rayleigh-derived Apparent Isotope Enrichment Factors ........................................ 40
    $^{15}$N Tracer Incubation Experiment – F168 ............................................................ 46
DISCUSSION ............................................................................................................... 49
  Co-occurrence of Denitrification and Anammox ..................................................... 49
Organic Carbon Induced Shift to Denitrification .......................................................... 51

NO₃ Isotopes as a Diagnostic of Anammox ............................................................... 53

Ammonium Isotopes as a Diagnostic ................................................................. 54

Isotope Modeling .................................................................................. 56

Summary ......................................................................................... 64

REFERENCES .................................................................................. 65
# LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Experimental treatments by year, depth, and amendment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Effective enrichment factors</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## LIST OF FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Cape Cod plume site map</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Depth profiles of selected chemical gradients at upgradient and downgradient sites</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>F575 2011 Natural Abundance Incubations</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>F575 2012 Natural Abundance Incubations</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>F168 2012 Natural Abundance Incubations</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>F168 2013 Natural Abundance Incubations</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>$\delta^{15}(\text{NO}_{3}^+) \text{ Rayleigh-derived Isotope Enrichment Factors}$</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>$\delta^{15}(\text{NO}_2) \text{ Rayleigh-derived Isotope Enrichment Factors}$</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>$\delta^{15}(\text{NH}_4^+) \text{ Rayleigh-derived Isotope Enrichment Factors}$</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>F168 2013 Tracer Incubations</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Model Fits and Parameters for F575 2012 #MI</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Model Fits and Parameters for F168 2012 #MI</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>Model Fits and Parameters for F575 2012 CMI</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>Model Fits and Parameters for F168 2012 CMI</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ABSTRACT

The relative inaccessibility of aquifers and co-occurrence of denitrification contribute to difficulties in assessing anammox contribution to total environmental N\textsubscript{2} production in this system. Anaerobic ammonium oxidation (anammox) is an autotrophic microbial process that converts NO\textsubscript{2}\textsuperscript{-} and NH\textsubscript{4}\textsuperscript{+} into nitrogen gas (N\textsubscript{2}), an alternate to denitrification in the nitrogen cycle. This process may be important in attenuating fixed nitrogen in groundwater prior to discharge into coastal systems. Nitrogen isotope enrichment factors have proven useful in identifying dominant processes within the overall nitrogen cycle in various environments, but the approach has not yet been directed at anammox outside of a pure culture setting. The influence of anammox on the nitrogen isotope dynamics of DIN species and N\textsubscript{2} was assessed through controlled laboratory incubations using groundwater and sediment from a nitrogen-contaminated groundwater plume with characterized anammox activity. These were conducted under conditions of varied anammox contribution to total N\textsubscript{2} production. Experimentally observed enrichment factors associated with nitrate (NO\textsubscript{3}\textsuperscript{-}) and nitrite (NO\textsubscript{2}\textsuperscript{-}) reduction ranged from -17 to -25‰ regardless of treatment. A finite time stepping model modified from Böhlke (2001) and Böhlke et al. (2002) was then used to determine a set of enrichment factors for the natural abundance incubations representing “best fits” for concentrations and isotope evolution of DIN species, N\textsubscript{2}, and N\textsubscript{2}O concentration. The modeled isotopic effects in the NO\textsubscript{2}\textsuperscript{-} and NO\textsubscript{3}\textsuperscript{-} pools were on a similar scale to that of denitrification and all greater than -30‰. This finding was consistent with results from separate \textsuperscript{15}N tracer experiments that suggested anammox accounts for up to 8 or 28% of N\textsubscript{2} production, depending on weighting of denitrification within treatments. NH\textsubscript{4}\textsuperscript{+} fractionations could not be clearly discerned from observed or modeled data likely because
of low rates, a large NH$_4^+$ pool, and isotopic exchange between aqueous and sediment NH$_4^+$ pools. Nitrogen isotope systematics appeared to be dominated by denitrification, and good modeled fits to experimental data could be attained within the range of published denitrification enrichment factors with or without anammox. This work highlights the challenges in interpreting in situ patterns of $\delta^{15}$N as unique indicators of anammox.
INTRODUCTION

Human activities have almost doubled the rate of nitrogen input to terrestrial systems (Vitousek et al. 1997). Watershed export of fixed nitrogen by rivers and streams ultimately deposits into the nitrogen-limited coastal ocean. This region, which accounts for half of the global ocean’s primary production (Paerl 1997), is disproportionally affected by the nitrogen input (Galloway et al. 2003), resulting in eutrophication, harmful algal blooms (Paerl 1997; Vitousek et al. 1997; Howarth and Marino 2006), ecological shifts towards lower trophic levels (Deegan et al. 2002), and changes in species composition (Hillebrand et al. 2000).

Increased delivery of watershed nitrogen to the continental margin can be offset by the removal of reactive N from surface and groundwater during transport. Only two known processes in the nitrogen cycle return fixed N to the form of N₂: denitrification and anaerobic ammonium oxidation (anammox; Dalsgaard et al. 2005; Seitzinger et al. 2006; reviewed by Song and Tobias 2011). Both reactions are microbially catalyzed and require anaerobic conditions.

Denitrification has been historically considered the primary mechanism of N₂ production. Denitrifying bacteria use oxidized nitrogen species (NOₓ) (Seitzinger et al. 2006; Eq 1) as terminal electron acceptors during respiration. A wide diversity of bacteria can perform denitrification either obligately or facultatively (reviewed by Robertson et al. 1989; Seitzinger et al. 2006) in anoxic water columns and/or sediments. Nitrate (NO₃⁻) is reduced to nitrite (NO₂⁻) via the dissimilarity nitrate reductase (NaR). Nitrite reductase (cytochrome cd₁) (NiR) reduces NO₂⁻ to nitric oxide (NO), which is itself reduced to N₂O via nitric-oxide reductase (NOR). Finally, N₂O reductase (NOS) converts N₂O to N₂ (Körner and Zumft 1989).
Eq. 1) \[ OC + NO_3^- \rightarrow NO_2^- \rightarrow NO \rightarrow N_2O \rightarrow N_2 (g) \]

Denitrification can terminate at $N_2O$ in limited electron environments and/or under trace oxygen conditions (Seitzinger et al. 2006) which can affect total $N_2O$ emissions in terrestrial and aquatic systems (Bouwman et al. 1995; Huang et al. 2008). In surface water and terrestrial environments, organic carbon (OC) is the ultimate electron donor for all reaction steps, while OC and mineral phase electron donors (e.g. reduced sulfate) can also support denitrification in groundwater (Böhlke and Denver 1995; Appelo and Postma 2005). The oxidized nitrogen $NO_3^-$ and/or $NO_2^-$ can be supplied from the aqueous phase (e.g. diffusion from the water column), or denitrification can be tightly coupled to sedimentary sources of $NO_x$ produced locally from nitrification in adjacent oxic microzones (Risgaard-Petersen 2003, Seitzinger et al. 2006).

Anammox, which also requires an anoxic environment, uses ammonium ($NH_4^+$) as the source of electrons to reduce $NO_2^-$ to $N_2$ (Eqs. 2, 3). Unlike denitrification, which is heterotrophic, anammox bacteria are chemolithotrophic and capable of fixing inorganic carbon with electrons afforded by ammonium (Sliekers et al. 2002). Only a few species of bacteria have been identified that are capable of performing the anammox reaction (*Candidatus Brocadia anammoxidans, Candidatus Brocadia brodae, Candidatus Scalindua wagneri, Candidatus Scalindua sorokinii, Candidatus Anammoxoglobus propionicus*) (Strous et al. 1999; Schmid et al. 2003; Dale et al. 2009; Kartal et al. 2008). $NO_2^-$ is initially reduced to NO via nitrite reductase (NiR). The NO then reacts with ammonium ($NH_4^+$) through the hydrazine oxidoreductase (HZO) enzyme to form a short-lived hydrazine ($N_2H_4$) intermediate (Schalk et al. 1998). Breakdown of the unstable $N_2H_4$ forms $N_2$ which contains one N from $NO_2^-$ and the other
from NH$_4^+$. All reactions take place within an organelle specific to annamox bacteria called the annamoxosome, where ladderane lipids make up a membrane that protects the reaction from trace amounts of O$_2$ (Strous et al. 2006, Dalsgaard et al. 2005; Kalvelage et al. 2011).

**Eq. 2)**

$$\text{NO}_2^- \rightarrow \text{NO} + \text{NH}_4^+ \rightarrow \text{N}_2\text{H}_4 \rightarrow \text{N}_2 + \text{H}_2\text{O}$$

\[\text{NiR}\quad\text{HZO}\]

Simplified, the reaction is as follows:

**Eq. 3)**

$$\text{NH}_4^+ + \text{NO}_2^- \rightarrow \text{N}_2 + 2\text{H}_2\text{O}$$

For anammox, the NH$_4^+$ serves as the electron donor and no external source of organic carbon is required for the redox reaction, although there is evidence that anammox can use low molecular weight organic carbon substrates such as formate (Smith et al. 2001; Kartal et al. 2007), but with little significant influence on overall rate of N$_2$ production. Anaerobic degradation of organic matter supplies NH$_4^+$ in anammox amenable environments, as does anthropogenic waste disposal. The NO$_2^-$ substrate appears in the water column as an intermediate from aerobic ammonium oxidation (e.g. nitrification; Mulder et al. 1995; Siegrist et al. 1998; Third et al. 2005; Lam et al. 2007), and/or following the nitrate reduction step of denitrification (Song and Tobias 2011; Trimmer et al. 2005; Dalsgaard et al. 2005), and/or dissimilatory nitrate reduction to ammonium (DNRA; Giblin et al. 2013). The common NO$_2^-$ substrate shared between anammox, denitrification, and nitrification, as well as potentially NH$_4^+$ between anammox and DNRA, provide challenges to studying anammox *in situ.*
Denitrification has been exhaustively measured in terrestrial soils (Seitzinger et al. 2006), groundwater (Mariotti et al. 1988; Smith et al. 1991, 2001; Schmidt et al. 2011), wetlands (Seitzinger et al. 2006; Burgin et al. 2010; Harrison et al. 2011), and coastal zones (An and Joye 2001; Risgaard-Petersen 2003). Anammox measurements in surface water environments have similarly been carried out with increasing frequency since the reaction’s discovery (Dalsgaard et al. 2005; Hamersley et al. 2009). N\textsubscript{2} production previously attributed solely to denitrification has proven to be a mixture of N\textsubscript{2} produced by both processes (Risgaard-Petersen et al. 2003) in various settings. Anammox has been identified in locations such as anoxic water columns of the Black Sea (Kuypers et al. 2003; Lam et al. 2007) and Golfo Dulce (Dalsgaard et al. 2003), Arctic sea ice (Rysgaard and Glud 2004), coastal sediments such as those of the Thames estuary (Trimmer et al. 2003), lake sediments (Souza et al. 2012), and oxygen minimum zones of the ocean water column (Thamdrup et al. 2006). Except for a handful of studies in contaminated aquifers (Clark et al. 2008, Moore et al. 2011; Robertson et al. 2012), quantification of groundwater anammox has largely escaped attention.

Groundwater acts as a long term repository for terrestrial nitrogen and represents both a significant water resource and a delivery route for nitrogen loads that ultimately deposit in the coastal ocean, either directly or by discharge to streams and rivers (Giblin and Gaines 1990; Lyngkilde and Christensen 1992; Valiela et al. 1997, 1999; Cole et al. 2006; Swartz et al. 2006; Robertson et al. 2012). While aquifers vary widely in redox state and speciation of dissolved nitrogen concentration, much of the organic carbon is typically respired soon after recharge and thus tends to be organic-carbon poor relative to their surface water counterparts. Those aquifers that are N-rich, anaerobic, and carbon poor should be favorable for anammox (Clark et al. 2008).
Recent global estimates of in-aquifer conversion of reactive N to N\textsubscript{2} are based on organic carbon proxies for denitrification. Because these estimates (20% of global N\textsubscript{2} production from denitrification in freshwater) were derived using organic carbon as a proxy (Bouwman et al. 2002; Seitzinger et al. 2006) and anammox does not require an external source of OC, it is conceivable that current groundwater global N\textsubscript{2} production values are underestimating the contribution of anammox.

Biogeochemical reactions in general, and anammox and denitrification in particular, are difficult to study in aquifers due to relative inaccessibility of reaction sites. Molecular approaches have been useful for identifying genes of free living bacteria in groundwater, but these measurements do not necessarily correlate with activity, and Quantitative PCR (qPCR) approaches for anammox gene expression are only now maturing (Song and Tobias 2011) and have yet to be calibrated as proxies for rates. In order to derive these reaction rates, hydrogeologists and geochemists have approached this problem by examining changes in chemical ratios (e.g. N\textsubscript{2}/Ar) along flow paths, and also by turning to \textit{in situ} tracer experiments coupled to advection-dispersion models to derive reaction rates (Garabedian et al. 1991; Tobias et al. 2001; Smith et al. 2004; Böhlke et al. 2006; Roberston et al. 2012; Jahangir et al. 2013).

One such approach used to identify numerous different nitrogen cycle reactions, including denitrification in aquifers \textit{in situ}, is natural abundance \textsuperscript{15}N stable isotopes (δ\textsuperscript{15}N).

All natural abundance isotopic values are expressed in the delta notation (δ\textsuperscript{15}N) in units of per mille according to:

\textbf{Eq. 4)} \quad \delta = \left( \frac{R_{\text{sample}}}{R_{\text{standard}}} - 1 \right) \times 1000\%
Where R is the ratio of the heavy to the light isotope, and the nitrogen standard is set at 0‰ for atmospheric nitrogen.

The distribution of stable isotope ratios has been used previously in other groundwater studies involving denitrification (Mariotti et al. 1982, 1988; Böhlke et al. 2004, 2009; Green et al. 2010), and has more recently been applied to infer anammox activities in aquifers. For example, Clark et al. (2008) examined an aquifer with a history of ammonium contamination from nearby chemical and fertilizer companies. Using well surveys across the downstream flowpath and mixing curves, the study concluded that that the enrichment of $\delta^{15}$NO$_3$ and $\delta^{15}$NH$_4^+$ indicated a reactive loss of both substrates. Combined with an overpressuring N$_2$ gas increase, anammox was suggested as the mechanism of N loss. Similarly, during an in situ experiment, Robertson et al. (2011) found enrichment in $\delta^{15}$NH$_4^+$ over a gradient at a site abundant in anammox bacteria, correspondent with NH$_4^+$ attenuation, suggesting anammox as a possible active process. In a laboratory incubation experiment using two sites with anammox bacteria present, Moore et al. (2011) found up to 18 and 36% of groundwater N$_2$ production attributable to anammox. Studies such as these show the usefulness of stable isotope distributions in inferring the contribution of individual reactions to the extant N pools. However, these groundwater anammox studies only represent a start. A more robust use of natural abundance N isotopes to assess the relative prevalence of anammox in aquifers where denitrification may also be present requires a refined understanding of how each of these reactions fractionate the various DIN species in each of the reaction pathways. Many of these fractionation factors ($\alpha$) have been studied for steps in denitrification pathways in cultures (Granger et al. 2008; Kritee et al. 2012) and in the environment (Mariotti et al. 1981; Voss et al. 2001; Böhlke et al. 2006, Perez et al. 2006; Sutka et al. 2008;). The lack of widely available pure anammox cultures has until recently
hampered estimation of anammox fractionation factors in culture (Brunner et al. 2013), though there are estimates from the environment based on localized $^{15}$N enrichment of ammonium in anaerobic marine sediments (Prokopenko et al. 2013).

The fractionation factor ($\alpha$) describes the relative difference in the reaction rates of heavy and light isotopologues during a unidirectional reaction, and here is defined by the ratio of the rate constants ($k$) for a reaction regarding $^{15}$N and $^{14}$N (Mariotti et al. 1981) (Eq 5).

\[
\text{Eq. 5)} \quad \alpha = \frac{k_{^{15}N}}{k_{^{14}N}}
\]

\[
\text{Eq. 6)} \quad \varepsilon = (\alpha - 1) \times 1000
\]

The term $\alpha$ is often reported as the enrichment factor (epsilon, $\varepsilon$), reported in per mille ($\%_0$) units; Eq 6, the proportion by which the product of the reaction is enriched by the heavier isotope in relation to the substrate (Mariotti et al. 1981).

Here we describe a series of experiments designed to establish enrichment factors associated with the production and/or consumption of the DIN species participating in the anammox reaction, as manifested in a nitrogen contaminated shallow coastal aquifer. Anammox activity has been detected at this aquifer, co-occurring with variable amounts of denitrification. The overarching objective of this study was to determine whether specific N isotope fractionations are unique to anammox, and can serve as a diagnostic for anammox when applied to broader aquifer-scale surveys of $\delta^{15}$N-DIN.
STUDY SITE

A series of natural abundance isotope fractionation incubation experiments and a single $^{15}$N tracer experiment were conducted using aquifer sediments collected from a nitrogen contaminated wastewater groundwater plume located on Cape Cod, MA (Figure 1). Though the sewage disposal via infiltration beds was discontinued in 1995, the legacy plume still exists at dimensions of 6 km long, 1 km in width, and 23 m in thickness. Two locations in the plume – upper and lower plume – were chosen for the study. The upper plume location (F575; 41°38'11.74"N, 70°32'31.52"W) is located 300 m from the infiltration beds. The lower plume location (F168; 41°37'1.64"N, 70°32'56.24"W) is located 2 km downgradient in the Ashumet Valley (USGS Cape Cod Toxics 2013). These two locations were chosen as sites sufficiently suboxic to support anammox, and whose potential activity was confirmed by $^{15}$N tracer and the presence of the HZO functional gene (Song et al. 2010). Denitrification has been reported at both sites, with higher rates at F575 closer to the infiltration beds, and lower rates at F168 where denitrification is thought to be limited by the availability of labile DOC (Thurman et al. 1986; Smith and Duff 1988; Smith et al. 1991; Barbaro et al. 2013). Aquifer sediments and groundwater were collected from F575 in 2011 and 2012, and from F168 in 2012 and 2013.
Figure 1. Map of the Cape Cod groundwater plume study site. The orange delineates the plume boundaries and green arrows indicate groundwater flow direction.
Figure 2. Depth profiles of selected chemical gradients at sites F575 and F168. Arrows denote depths from which sediments and water were collected (Barbaro et al. 2013; Smith et al. per. Com).
Table 1. Experimental treatments by year, depth, and amendment. #MI indicates a nonacetate treatment, and CMI indicates an acetate treatment, with C as the notation for carbon.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Site</th>
<th>Elevation (m alt NAVD88)</th>
<th>Depth ID</th>
<th>Amendment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>F575</td>
<td>-2.1 -3.6</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>#MI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>D</td>
<td>CMI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>F575</td>
<td>7.6 - 6.1</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>#MI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>CMI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>F168</td>
<td>-7 - -8</td>
<td>single depth</td>
<td>#MI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CMI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>F168</td>
<td>-7 - -8</td>
<td>single depth</td>
<td>#MI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CMI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>F168</td>
<td>-7 - -8</td>
<td>single depth</td>
<td>#MI Tracer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>CMI Tracer</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
At the upper plume site (F575), sediments from 2 aquifer depths (Deep-D; -2.1 to -3.6 m alt NAVD88, and Middle-M; 7.6 to 6.1 m alt NAVD88) were collected in 2011 and 2012, respectively. Sampling depths that aligned with areas of the geochemical gradient likely to support anammox were chosen (Figure 2). These zones were characterized by a transition in N speciation and/or where denitrification or nitrification had been previously documented that might supply NO$_2^-$ for anammox (Barbaro et al. 2013). The F575 middle depth (M) collected in 2012 had previously shown anammox activity measured during an in situ $^{15}$NO$_2$ tracer injection experiment.

A single depth was sampled at the lower plume site (F168; -7 to 8 m alt NAVD88) in 2012 and 2013. This zone contained high NO$_3^-$ (255 μM) and NH$_4^+$ (451 μM), but non-detectable NO$_2^-$, and denitrification was reported to be severely limited by a lack of degradable organic carbon. An in situ $^{15}$NO$_2$ tracer experiment performed nearby at the same aquifer depth indicated a dominance of anammox over denitrification.

All sediments were collected using a drilling rig equipped with a sand auger and split spoon sampler. After collection, sediments were stored in headspace free mason jars at 4° C until use in the incubation experiments.

**EXPERIMENTAL APPROACH**

*Natural Abundance Incubations* - To determine enrichment factors for various N species involved in anammox and denitrification, we conducted a series of aquifer sediment and groundwater slurry incubations. All incubations were designed as anaerobic. Amendments were made with two primary high concentration combinations (+ NO$_2^-$, NH$_4^+$, with/without acetate)
and designated as CMI (+ acetate) and #MI (nonacetate) in order to create environments that favored different amounts of anammox vs denitrification. Downgradient amendments did not include NH$_4^+$ due to an already existing high background in the groundwater at that site.

Groundwater used in the slurry natural abundance incubations was collected in headspace-free 1 L glass brown bottles from the same plume location and depth as the aquifer sediment. Approximately 10 g of sediment wet-weight was placed into 60 ml serum vials, capped, and immediately evacuated by vacuum to remove any atmosphere introduced during the transfer. The remaining space in the serum bottles was filled with groundwater that had been previously amended according to the treatment and sparged with a gas mixture of argon (1%), nitrogen (80%), and helium (19%). Serum bottles were then crimped with thick butyl stoppers and placed in a roller incubator to continuously mix the slurry during the incubation and minimize any diffusion limitation effects on isotope fractionation.

Time series samples were collected by sacrificing individual serum slurry bottles in triplicate at each time point and analyzed for concentrations and isotopic composition of the NH$_4^+$, NO$_3^-$/NO$_2^-$, and N$_2$ fractions. Aliquots for different analytes and isotopic analyses were distributed using a peristaltic pump. DIN (frozen), $^{15}$NH$_4^+$ (frozen), and $^{15}$NO$_3^-$/NO$_2^-$ (KOH preserved to pH 12) were 0.2 um filtered. The aliquot for δ$^{15}$N$_2$ analysis and N$_2$ production was not filtered, but was pumped directly into a helium-flushed 30 ml serum vial containing 200 μl of 2N potassium hydroxide (KOH).

**Tracer Incubations** - $^{15}$NO$_2^-$ tracer incubations were performed to complement and further investigate the results of the natural abundance fractionation experiments. They were done specifically for three reasons: 1) to further isolate and verify the rates of anammox in the natural abundance set; 2) to determine the efficacy of acetate additions for enhancing denitrification.
relative to anammox; 3) to examine the magnitude of DNRA as a potential constraint on interpreting natural abundance changes in NH$_4^+$ from the natural abundance experiments.

Slurries were prepared as described for the fractionation incubations except that 20 g of sediments were used and incubations were done in larger (130 ml) serum bottles. Bottles were incubated for 7 days prior to tracer injection to ensure removal of trace oxygen from the matrix and create a reducing environment. Two treatments were done: 1) $^{15}$NO$_2^-$ only; and 2) $^{15}$NO$_2^-$ + acetate. Target concentrations for NO$_2^-$ and acetate were 200 μM and 250 μM, respectively. The $^{15}$N isotopic enrichment of $^{15}$NO$_2^-$ was at >99 At%. Individual vials were sacrificed at intervals to measure concentrations and isotopic composition of the NH$_4^+$, NO$_3^-$/NO$_2^-$, and N$_2$ and N$_2$O fractions during the course of the incubations.

**ANALYTICAL METHODS**

Both natural abundance and tracer incubations used the same analytical methods with respect to N concentrations and isotopic analyses.

NH$_4^+$ concentrations were measured using the phenol-hypochlorite method (Weatherburn 1967), and NO$_3^-$ and NO$_2^-$ were measured by N-Naphthylethylene-diamine azodye formation with and without cadmium reduction, respectively as described by the Greiss Test (Armstrong et al. 1967). N$_2$O was analyzed on a Gas Chromatograph-Electron Capture Detector (GC-ECD).

$^{15}$N$_2$ was measured using continuous flow isotope-ratio mass spectrometry (IRMS). The $\delta^{15}$N$_2$ IRMS analysis used the Gas Bench (GB) interface equipped with a molecular sieve 5A GC column and analyzed at 32° C. $\delta^{15}$N$_2$ was measured, as well as N$_2$, O$_2$, and Ar. Air calibrations of 50, 75, and 120 μl air, were run each day of analysis, and permitted calibration of N$_2$ area and
N₂/Ar ratios to changes in N₂ mass. All of δ¹⁵N₂ were normalized to air δ¹⁵N values using the air standards.

¹⁵NH₄⁺ was measured using an ammonia acid trap diffusion method (Holmes et al. 1999) where ammonium was converted to ammonia gas at pH >11 and trapped as ammonium sulfate on a K₂SO₄ acidified glass fiber filter. The filter was then combusted in a Costech elemental analyzer (EA) and the δ¹⁵N analyzed in a coupled IRMS. All δ¹⁵NH₄⁺ data were two-point normalized to air δ¹⁵N using known reference materials USGS 40 and 41 L-glutamic acid run concurrently with the ammonium filters.

¹⁵N enrichments from the tracer experiments are expressed as ¹⁵N mole fractions or, for N₂, individually as the mass of the individual 29 and 30 N₂ isotopologues.

**DATA SYNTHESIS**

**Natural Abundance** – The concentration and δ¹⁵N data from the natural abundance experiments was used to determine the effective net enrichment factor (epsilon = ε) according to the Rayleigh model (Eq. 7).

\[
\delta_s = \delta_{s0} + \varepsilon \ln \frac{C}{C_0}
\]

Where \( C \) is the molar concentration of the substrate at time \( t \), with \( C_0 \) being at \( t = 0 \), \( \delta_s \) is the isotopic composition at \( t \), with \( \delta_{s0} \) being at \( t = 0 \), and \( \varepsilon \) is the isotopic enrichment factor. (Mariotti et al. 1988).

When \( \delta_s \) is plotted against the natural log of \( C \), \( \varepsilon \) in per mille (‰) can be estimated from the slope. Because \( \varepsilon \) potentially represents the net effect of isotopic changes due to the input and
output in several pools, we also used a finite difference time stepping model, modified from Böhlke (2001) and Böhlke et al. (2002), to assess the nitrogen isotope dynamics in the incubations.

The purposes of this modeling effort were to specifically investigate enrichment factors for anammox, examine the relative effects of varying amounts of anammox, denitrification, and DNRA on the $\delta^{15}$N values of NO$_3^-$, NO$_2^-$, NH$_4^+$, and N$_2$, and to help assess the utility of in situ distribution of these $\delta^{15}$N values as a diagnostic indicator of contributions from these reactions to overall aquifer N-cycling. At each time step of the model, an individual N pool ($N_i$) mass balance was calculated with respect to total N mass, and individually for $^{14}$N and $^{15}$N. In addition to calculating the micromolar N concentration at each time step, $\delta^{15}$N values are also calculated at each time step from the individual $^{14}$N and $^{15}$N concentrations.

The total N in an individual pool (e.g. NO$_2^-$, or NH$_4^+$, or N$_2$) at each time step ($N_i$) was calculated from N at the previous time-step ($N_{i-1}$) and the difference between the masses of N entering the pool ($N_{in}$) from various sources, and N leaving the pool ($N_{out}$) over the time interval (Eq. 8).

\[ N_i = N_{i-1} + \Sigma N_{ins} - \Sigma N_{outs} \]  

**Eq. 8)**

Michaelis Mention kinetics was used to parameterize input and output terms, $N_{in}$ and $N_{out}$, based on:

\[ \frac{V_{max} \cdot [ ]_{t-1}}{K_s + [ ]_{t-1}} \times \Delta t \]  

**Eq. 9)**
Where $V_{\text{max}}$ and $K_s$ are the maximum rate and half saturation constant, respectively. Brackets denote concentrations either for donor species importing N into the pool of interest, or in the case of reactions removing N, the concentration of the pool of interest. The $^{14}$N and $^{15}$N inventories at each time step were calculated from equations 10 and 11.

**Eq. 10**  
$$14N_t = 14N_{t-1} + \left[ \frac{N_{\text{int}}}{\alpha_{\text{input}} 15N_{\text{donor},t-1} + 1} \right] - \left[ \frac{N_{\text{out}}}{\alpha_{\text{output}} 15N_{t-1} + 1} \right]$$

**Eq. 11**  
$$15N_t = 15N_{t-1} + \left[ \frac{N_{\text{int}}}{\alpha_{\text{input}} 15N_{\text{donor},t-1} + 1} \right] - \left[ \frac{N_{\text{out}}}{\alpha_{\text{output}} 15N_{t-1} + 1} \right]$$

Finally, at each time step the $^{14}$N and $^{15}$N inventories are used to calculate a $\delta^{15}$N value for each N species:

**Eq. 12**  
$$\delta^{15}N = 1000 \cdot \left[ \left( \frac{15N_t}{14N_t} \right) \cdot 272 - 1 \right]$$

Best model fits to measured concentration and $\delta^{15}$N data for NO$_3^-$, NO$_2^-$, NH$_4^+$, and N$_2$ were achieved by adjusting $V_{\text{max}}$, $K_s$, and $\alpha$ values for each reaction. These parameters were constrained by literature values and by the following additional constraints established from the tracer incubations and/or field tracer injections: 1) the DNRA to (amammox + denitrification) ratio was $\leq 0.25$; 2) the anammox to denitrification ratio was $\leq 0.4$; 3) all alphas were $\geq 0.970$ and $\leq 1.0$. 
Tracer – The following equations were used to calculate anammox (Eq. 13), denitrification (Eq. 14), and DNRA (Eq. 15) from data generated in the tracer experiments (Thamdrup and Dalsgaard 2002).

**Eq. 13)** \[ N_2_{\text{anammox}} = \left[ {^{29}N_2 + 2 \times (1 - (1/MF_{NO2})) \times {^{30}N_2}} \right] / MF_{NO2} \]

**Eq. 14)** \[ N_2_{\text{denitrification}} = {^{30}N_2} / (MF_{NO2})^2 \]

**Eq. 15)** \[ DNRA = [(MF_{NH4} - R) \times NH_{4+\text{tot}}] / MF_{NO2} \]

Where $MF$ denotes the mole fraction of $^{15}$N in NO$_{2}^-$ or NH$_{4}^+$ pools. NH$_{4}^{+\text{tot}}$ refers to mass of all NH$_4^+$ present in the incubation. $^{29}N_2$ and $^{30}N_2$ refer to the production rates of mass 29 and 30 N$_2$ isotopologues, respectively.
RESULTS

NATURAL ABUNDANCE FRACTIONATION EXPERIMENTS

Upgradient F57 Site - The F575 experiments were performed with sediments collected from two depths: 1) the zone of -2.1 - -3.6 m alt NAVD88 (D) characterized by moderate NH₄⁺ elevation; and 2) the zone of 7.6 – 6.1 m alt NAVD88 (M) located at the base of the NO₃⁻ region. During the 2011 F575 D zone sediment incubations, the nonacetate #MI treatment (NH₄⁺ and NO₂⁻) showed NO₃⁻ drawdown prior to that of NO₂⁻ (Figure 3.a). Complete NO₃⁻ and NO₂⁻ removal occurred by day 18 and day 31, respectively. The NH₄⁺ concentration also decreased initially from 80 μM to a minimum of 55 μM at day 31, and then increased to 67 μM by day 47. The net total loss of NH₄⁺ during the incubation was 13 μM, or about 20% of the initial aqueous concentration (Figure 3.a). The δ¹⁵N of all DIN species steadily increased during the incubation. Large enrichments (up to 30‰) were measured in δ¹⁵NO₃⁻ and δ¹⁵NO₂⁻, with a 4‰ increase in δ¹⁵NH₄⁺ over the same duration (Figure 3.b). The end product of denitrification and/or anammox, N₂, showed a net increase of 66 μM in 47 days. The rate of production was greatest between days 0 and 18 (2 μM/day). The pattern of δ¹⁵N₂ was characterized by an initial δ¹⁵N₂ depletion of 0.5‰, followed by a rise in the δ¹⁵N₂ as the enriched NO₂⁻ found later in the incubation was converted to N₂ (Figure 3.c).

The addition of acetate (CMI) to the D zone sediments induced removal rates of NO₃⁻ and NO₂⁻ that appeared at least 2-3 times faster than those of the #MI treatment. Similar to the nonacetate treatment, NO₃⁻ consumption preceded NO₂⁻ loss. Similarly, NH₄⁺ also showed an initial rapid drop to a minimum of 58 μM at day 7. Unlike the nonacetate treatment, this occurred in the presence of trace O₂. This was followed by a leveling out of ammonium,
amounting to a loss on the order of 25% of the initial \( \text{NH}_4^+ \) concentration (Figure 3.d). Isotopic enrichments in CMI showed similar patterns to those of #MI, in \( \delta^{15}(\text{NO}_3^-) \) and \( \delta^{15}\text{NO}_2^- \) initial %, and in terms of the magnitude of enrichment in the \( \text{NO}_3^- \) and \( \text{NO}_2^- \) over time, but the isotopic shifts occurred faster in the CMI due to the faster \( \text{NO}_3^- \) and \( \text{NO}_2^- \) consumption rates (Figure 3.e). The \( \delta^{15}\text{NH}_4^+ \) initially rose by 4‰ during the period of trace \( \text{O}_2 \) (>10 μM) but was then invariant for the remainder of the experiment. \( \text{N}_2 \) production in CMI was 50% higher than #MI, and showed a marked plateau after day 18 after all the \( \text{NO}_3^- \) and \( \text{NO}_2^- \) had been drawn down. The greatest \( \text{N}_2 \) production rate occurred between day 0 and day 4 (10 μM/day), and was coincident with the initial drop in \( \delta^{15}\text{N}_2 \) as the pool received fractionated N from \( \text{NO}_2^- \). A rebounding enrichment in \( \delta^{15}\text{N}_2 \) of 1-1.5‰ followed the initial depletion to plateau values that were 0.3‰ higher than the initial \( \delta^{15}\text{N}_2 \) (Figure 3.f).
Figure 3. N concentrations and isotopes for incubations using upper plume F575 deep (D) sediments collected and incubated in 2011. Nonacetate (panels a, b, c) and acetate (panels d, e, f) are shown. The dashed line indicates the time at which trace oxygen was gone from the incubation. Standard deviations are reported for all data, but when not seen, the error bars are smaller than the size of the symbol.
F575 Zone M sediments were subject to the same NO$_2^-$ and NH$_4^+$ with/without acetate treatments as Zone D. Target initial concentrations for NO$_2^-$ were raised to 200 μM, and more sampling times were added. In the #MI treatment, ambient NO$_3^-$ of 27 μM was quickly reduced below 10 μM by day 4 and completely consumed by day 21. There was a lagged NO$_2^-$ removal that occurred during the trace O$_2$ period, which then accelerated between days 10 and 20, and continued until all NO$_2^-$ was consumed by day 40. NH$_4^+$ dropped initially by 20% by day 4 during the trace oxic period, and was then invariant for the remainder of the experiment. Up to 8 μM N$_2$O was detected at day 17 during NO$_x$ drawdown (Figure 4.a). Large δ$^{15}$N enrichments in excess of 45‰ were measured in NO$_2^-$ and NO$_3^-$ during the incubation. The δ$^{15}$NH$_4^+$ values initially rose by 4‰ up until day 9 during the trace O$_2$ period, but then plateaued between 8 and 9‰ for the remainder of the incubation (Figure 4.b). N$_2$ production lagged for the first week of the incubation, similar to the lag in NO$_2^-$ loss, followed by increases approximately equivalent to the amount of NO$_2^-$ loss. The δ$^{15}$N$_2$ showed the characteristic J-shaped pattern (“J-curve”) of initial isotopic depletion (to -1‰) commensurate with initial N$_2$ production, followed by a rise in δ$^{15}$N$_2$ towards the latter part of the incubation (Figure 4.c). The final δ$^{15}$N$_2$ was 0.3 to 0.5‰ higher than the starting δ$^{15}$N$_2$.

The CMI treatment in the M zone sediments showed a similar behavior for NO$_3^-$, NO$_2^-$, and NH$_4^+$ concentrations and isotopes, albeit with a 2 day shorter lag in NO$_3^-$ and NO$_2^-$ loss. N$_2$O concentration reached a peak concentration of 5 μM-N occurring at 20 days (Figure 4.d). This was concurrent with the point of 50% loss in NO$_2^-$, as well as the start of δ$^{15}$N$_2$ rise after its minimum. As observed in the #MI treatment, δ$^{15}$NO$_3^-$ and $^{15}$NO$_2^-$ increased linearly over time to >45‰, the δ$^{15}$NH$_4^+$ rose by 7‰ and plateaued, and the “J curve” in the δ$^{15}$N$_2$ was contemporaneous with N$_2$ production (Figure 4.e, f). CMI however yielded 15 μM more N$_2$ than
#MI, with the amplitude of the $\delta^{15}N_2$ J-curve (max $\delta^{15}N_2$-min $\delta^{15}N_2$) was 0.5‰ larger than that measured for #MI.
Figure 4. N concentrations and isotopes for incubations using upper plume F575 mid-depth (M) sediments collected and incubated in 2012. Nonacetate (#MI, a, b, c) and acetate (CMI, d, e, f) treatments are shown in vertical panels. Dashed lines indicate the end of the trace oxic period. N₂O concentrations are shown in combination with other DIN species concentrations.
Downgradient F168 Site - F168 treatments used sediments and groundwater from one depth (-7-8 m alt NAVD88), characterized by the presence of high NO$_3^-$ and NH$_4^+$ concentration. Treatments were identical to those used with the upgradient site. Overall, rates for #MI were slower than those measured at F575, but the CMI rates for both sites were similar (Figure 3-6). In the 2012 #MI experiment, both NO$_3^-$ and NO$_2^-$ increased in concentration (by 43 and 57μM, respectively) within the first 14 days during a period when trace O$_2$ was present in the incubation. Both concurrently decreased to residual levels (<6 μM) by day 57, but were never fully consumed by the end of the incubation. The #MI NH$_4^+$ initially decreased by 25% during the trace oxic period, but fluctuated over time between 60 and 95% of its initial concentration (265 μM). Net NH$_4^+$ loss was 107μM. N$_2$O was not present until after day 21, when it accumulated to a maximum of 33 μM-N by day 57 (Figure 5.a).

Because NO$_3^-$ and NH$_4^+$ were present in high concentrations at this site, initial isotopic enrichments for both represent background concentrations. δ$^{15}$NO$_3$ and δ$^{15}$NO$_2^-$ enrichments remained invariant around 10‰ and 2‰ until day 14, when they began to increase as both NO$_3^-$ and NO$_2^-$ were consumed. Enrichments up to 37‰ were measured in both pools by day 34. δ$^{15}$NH$_4^+$ fluctuated only between 16 and 17‰ (Figure 5.b) for the entire incubation. N$_2$ production occurred throughout the incubation, for a yield of 126 μM. The initial drop in δ$^{15}$N$_2$ was slow and reached its minimum of -0.54‰ on day 34. The subsequent “J-curve” rebound in δ$^{15}$N$_2$ reached a final enrichment at 1.8‰ greater than its initial value (Figure 5.c).

The CMI treatment showed similar behavior to the #MI in concentration but reaction rates were approximately twice those measured in #MI. NO$_3^-$ drawdown had a steeper slope than that of NO$_2^-$ and both were completely removed by day 33. NH$_4^+$ fluctuated widely within a range of 121 μM during the incubation but yielded a small net decrease of 22 μM. N$_2$O
production did not occur until after day 7, with a sharp rise to a maximum of 7 μM-N within 5 days. It fell steadily to 0 by day 33 (Figure 5.d).

The δ¹⁵NO₃⁺ and δ¹⁵NO₂⁻ isotope values increased by up to 55‰, at which point NO₂⁻ and NO₃⁻ were no longer detectable. Despite a small initial rise in δ¹⁵NH₄⁺ of 1‰, the value varied within the range of 16-18‰ throughout the incubation (Figure 5.e). Rapid N₂ production in the first 14 days plateaued by day 30 and yielded a total of 152 μM. The rapid N₂ production was accompanied by rapid depletion of δ¹⁵N₂, followed by the expected rise as the remaining NO₂⁻ was reduced. At the end of the incubation, maximum δ¹⁵N₂ was 1.5‰ greater than the initial (Figure 5.f).
Figure 5. N concentrations and isotopes for incubations using lower plume F168 sediments collected and incubated in 2012. Nonacetate (#MI) and acetate (CMI) treatments are shown in vertical panels. Dashed lines indicate the end of the trace oxic period. N₂O concentrations are shown in combination with other DIN species concentrations.
F168 sediments collected in 2012 were used again in a repeat incubation experiment in 2013 to better constrain the enrichment factors. The same treatments were used. The nonacetate #MI treatment showed an extremely low NO\textsubscript{x} reduction and N\textsubscript{2} production rate relative to the 2012 experiment when sediments were fresher. A low rate of NO\textsubscript{3}\textsuperscript{−} loss was accompanied by a near quantitative rise in NO\textsubscript{2}\textsuperscript{−}. NO\textsubscript{2}\textsuperscript{−} did not decrease throughout the entire incubation. NH\textsubscript{4}\textsuperscript{+}, which decreased from day 0 – 9, afterwards slowly increased to a value near the initial NH\textsubscript{4}\textsuperscript{+} concentration of 368 μM by the end of the sampling period (Figure 6.a).

An initial δ\textsuperscript{15}NO\textsubscript{3+2} value of 7‰ in the #MI treatment rose steadily throughout the experiment at a rate of about 0.13‰ per day to a maximum enrichment of 20‰. δ\textsuperscript{15}NO\textsubscript{2}\textsuperscript{−} was initially lighter than δ\textsuperscript{15}NO\textsubscript{3+2}, but matched its enrichment by day 21. δ\textsuperscript{15}NH\textsubscript{4}\textsuperscript{+} initially decreased during the trace O\textsubscript{2} phase, but varied less than 1‰ throughout the course of the experiment (Figure 6.b). Very slow linear N\textsubscript{2} production was characterized by a slow linear δ\textsuperscript{15}N\textsubscript{2} depletion of 1‰ during the entire incubation. Insufficient conversion of NO\textsubscript{2}\textsuperscript{−} occurred to cause a rebound in the δ\textsuperscript{15}N\textsubscript{2} as observed in the other incubations (Fig 6.c).

In the corresponding CMI treatment, faster rates relative to #MI resulted in fully consumed NO\textsubscript{3}\textsuperscript{−} within the first 3 days and NO\textsubscript{2}\textsuperscript{−} by day 50. These NO\textsubscript{x} reduction rates were on par with the 2012 CMI experiment, indicating that the very low rates in the 2013 #MI relative to 2012 were probably related to less available carbon in older unamended sediments. NH\textsubscript{4}\textsuperscript{+} varied within an 89 μM range, but showed a pattern of initial decrease while NO\textsubscript{2}\textsuperscript{−} was consumed, and was followed by rising NH\textsubscript{4}\textsuperscript{+} until the end of the incubation (Figure 6.d).

δ\textsuperscript{15}NO\textsubscript{3+2} showed strong enrichments up to 80‰ during the rapid reduction of NO\textsubscript{2}\textsuperscript{−} and NO\textsubscript{3}\textsuperscript{−}. δ\textsuperscript{15}NH\textsubscript{4}\textsuperscript{+} showed a small 1‰ enrichment between days 0-3, followed by little to no variation (±0.3‰) for the remainder of the incubation (Figure 6.e). The pattern of N\textsubscript{2} was
characteristic of the other CMI incubations, with rapid N\textsubscript{2} production followed by a plateau after all NO\textsubscript{x} had been consumed. The general “J-shaped” curve was evident in the $\delta^{15}$N\textsubscript{2}, albeit with some higher variance than observed in the other treatments. The $\delta^{15}$N\textsubscript{2} dropped to 0.5‰ and eventually rebounded to a maximum of 2‰ by the end of the incubation (Figure 6.f).
Figure 6. N concentrations and isotopes for incubations using lower plume F168 sediments collected and incubated in 2012. Nonacetate (#MI) and acetate (CMI) treatments are shown in vertical panels. Dashed lines indicate the end of the trace oxic period. N₂O concentrations are shown in combination with other DIN species concentrations.
Rayleigh-derived Apparent Isotope Enrichment Factors – Rayleigh plots relating change in N species concentration to change in $\delta^{15}N$ were constructed for the O$_2$ free portions of all natural abundance incubations. The Rayleigh plots for the upper plume F575 were characterized by high NO$_2^-$ and low NO$_3^-$, so NO$_{3+2}$ enrichment factors derived from $^{15}$N analysis with P. aurofaciens were similar to those for NO$_2^-$ only derived from $^{15}$N analyses using S. nitritireducens.

All experiments showed good fits ($r^2 \geq 0.82$) for the NO$_{3+2}$ and NO$_2^-$ data in the majority of treatments. The NO$_{3+2}$ enrichment factors were within 1-2‰ of the NO$_2^-$ enrichment factors (Figure 7-8). For the D zone sediments, nonacetate NO$_{3+2}$ and NO$_2^-$ fractionations did not generate good fits to yield enrichment factors (p > 0.05). In comparison, plus acetate treatments yielded enrichment factors of -23 and -21‰ for NO$_{3+2}$ and NO$_2^-$ respectively (Table 2). For the M zone sediments, the #MI treatment yielded 3-4‰ magnitude greater enrichment factors for NO$_{3+2}$ and NO$_2^-$ ($\varepsilon = -19‰$) relative to the deep sediments, but the acetate CMI treatments were identical between the two sediment types ($\varepsilon = -21‰$) (Table 2). For ammonium, very poor fits to the Rayleigh model were found for all treatments in both zones when all $\delta^{15}$NH$_4^+$ and concentration data were examined (Figure 9). The poor fits were likely due to both small changes in NH$_4^+$ concentration, and to competing reactions/sediment-water exchanges at different times of the incubation (e.g. aerobic ammonium oxidation near the start of the incubation fueled by trace O$_2$ at greater than 10 µM entrained into the serum bottle). NH$_4^+$ isotope and concentration data analyzed after trace O$_2$ removal and the establishment of reducing conditions showed no improvement in the Rayleigh fits for #MI treatments (Figure 9.a-b). CMI $\delta^{15}$NH$_4^+$ exhibited fits ($r^2 > 0.72$, p < 0.05) with enrichment factors of -15 and -16‰ for D and M
zone sediments, respectively during the presence of trace O\textsubscript{2} (suggestive of aerobic ammonium oxidation), but poor Rayleigh fits remained after O\textsubscript{2} fell below 10 \mu M (Figure 9.a-b).

Rayleigh plots at the downgradient F168 site for 2012 and 2013 experiments yielded good fits for all NO\textsubscript{3+2} and NO\textsubscript{2} concentration and isotope data ($r^2 \geq 0.85$) (Figures 7-8). Here there was high background NO\textsubscript{3} in addition to the added NO\textsubscript{2}, so unique enrichment factors for NO\textsubscript{3} and NO\textsubscript{2} reduction could be derived from the measured NO\textsubscript{3+2} and NO\textsubscript{2} $\delta^{15}$N analyses. This was possible for the #MI treatments where NO\textsubscript{3} remained long enough to capture changes in concentration, but not in the CMI treatments where NO\textsubscript{3} was consumed faster than the timescale of sampling. In both the 2012 and 2013 experiments, the #MI treatment yielded enrichment factors for NO\textsubscript{2} reduction that were 8-12$\%$ magnitude greater than NO\textsubscript{3} reduction, yet the magnitudes of the enrichment factors were very different for each species between years. The faster 2012 experiment isotope effects for NO\textsubscript{2} and NO\textsubscript{3} loss were -27 and -8$\%$ respectively (Figure 7.c, d). The 2013 experiment, where low rates of NO\textsubscript{3} loss were accompanied by relatively little loss of NO\textsubscript{2}, yielded very large apparent enrichment factors for NO\textsubscript{2} and NO\textsubscript{3} of -47 and -35$\%$. These enrichment factors in the #MI treatments represent the net effect of both the NO\textsubscript{3} and NO\textsubscript{2} reductions. When the NO\textsubscript{3+2} enrichment factors are considered for #MI, 2012 and 2013 show similar values of -17 and -19$\%$ despite the large difference in reaction rates. These enrichment factors were similar to values to those found in the #MI F575 experiments. Similar to the upgradient F575 experiments, the $\delta^{15}$NH\textsubscript{4} Rayleigh plots did not yield good fits ($r^2 \leq 0.06$). Separating data into a post-O\textsubscript{2} removal period did not improve the fits during the O\textsubscript{2} free period, but did permit estimation of an enrichment factor for NH\textsubscript{4} loss during the trace O\textsubscript{2} period in F168 2012 #MI when aerobic ammonium oxidation was likely operating.
Figure 7. Rayleigh plots for combined $\delta^{15}(\text{NO}_3^{+2})$ for all four natural abundance experiments. Effective enrichment factors ($\varepsilon$) for NO2+3 reduction were estimated from the slope of these plots and summarized in Table 2. Red symbols indicate data collected during a period of trace oxygen in the incubations.
Figure 8. Rayleigh plots for $\delta^{15}\text{(NO}_2\text{)}$ for all four natural abundance experiments. Effective enrichment factors ($\varepsilon$) for NO$_2^-$ reduction were estimated from the slope of these plots and summarized in Table 2. Red symbols indicate data collected during a period of trace oxygen in the incubations.
Figure 9. Rayleigh plots for $\delta^{15}(\text{NH}_4^+)$. Effective enrichment factors ($\varepsilon$) could not be estimated from these data with the exception of F575-D-CMI, F575-M-#MI, and F168-#MI during the trace O$_2$ period. These enrichment factors likely reflect a dominance of aerobic ammonium oxidation and not anammox. Red symbols indicate data collected during a period of trace oxygen in the incubations.
Table 2. Apparent enrichment factors (epsilon: ε) imprinted from net N loss on discrete DIN pools. Where ε = (α – 1) x 1000, and α is the fractionation factor defined by the ratio of the rate constants (\(^{15}k/^{14}k\)) for a reaction. Isotope effects for \(\text{NO}_3^-, \text{NO}_2^-, \) and \(\text{NO}_3^{+2}\) are for the period after trace \(\text{O}_2\) has been consumed. Enrichment factors reported for \(\text{NH}_4^+\) are generated from aerobic periods, and are denoted in red with an asterisk. With the exception of F168 2013 \(\text{NO}_2^-\), only enrichment factors where \(p < 0.05\) and substrate concentration decreases by at least 20% are shown.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Experiment</th>
<th>Treatment Name</th>
<th>Substrate</th>
<th>-ε</th>
<th>(r^2)</th>
<th>Standard Error</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>F575 2011</td>
<td>D-CMI</td>
<td>(\text{NO}_3^{+2})</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>0.9734</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(\text{NO}_2^-)</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>0.9963</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(\text{NH}_4^+)</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>0.8560</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F575 2012</td>
<td>#MI</td>
<td>(\text{NO}_3^{+2})</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>0.9982</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CMI</td>
<td>(\text{NO}_3^{+2})</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>0.9881</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(\text{NO}_2^-)</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>0.9966</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(\text{NH}_4^+)</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>0.7167</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.033</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F168 2012</td>
<td>#MI</td>
<td>(\text{NO}_3^{+2})</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>0.9810</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(\text{NO}_3^-)</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.9342</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(\text{NO}_2^-)</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>0.9488</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CMI</td>
<td>(\text{NO}_3^{+2})</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0.7841</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.046</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(\text{NH}_4^+)</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>0.9339</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.034</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(\text{NO}_2^-)</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>0.9667</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F168 2013</td>
<td>#MI</td>
<td>(\text{NO}_3^{+2})</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>0.9395</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(\text{NO}_3^-)</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>0.8554</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(\text{NO}_2^-)</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>0.3195</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>0.089</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CMI</td>
<td>(\text{NO}_3^{+2})</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>0.9943</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(\text{NO}_2^-)</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>0.9964</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
\[^{15}\text{N} \text{ Tracer Incubation Experiment – F168 –} \]

In the #MI (nonacetate) treatment, ambient NO\(_3^-\) (71 \muM) was removed by day 31. NO\(_2^-\) concentration decreased by 17\% for a net loss of 41 \muM. The \[^{15}\text{N}\] enrichment of the added NO\(_2^-\) showed an isotope dilution during the incubation from 96 at\% to 77 at\% over 29 days (Figure 10). N\(_2\) production was not observed until day 31, but detectable mass 29 and mass 30 enrichments were measured as early as day 17 (mole fractions 0.020 and 0.051, respectively). The highest 29 and 30 mole fractions observed were 0.036 and 0.070 at day 31. Calculated anammox and denitrification rates (eq. 13, 14) within the last 12 days were 5.5 and 19 nmoles N/g sed/day respectively. Anammox accounted for 28\% of the total N\(_2\) production (Figure 10). Tracer incorporation into NH\(_4^+\) was observed and the \(\delta^{15}\text{NH}_4^+\) increased by 747‰ over the duration of the incubation (Figure 10). The calculated DNRA rate (eq. 15) was 1 nmoles-N/g sed/day. DNRA accounted for 4\% of the NO\(_2^-\) loss in the #MI treatment.

In the acetate treatment, NO\(_3^-\) drawdown was complete by day 3. NO\(_2^-\) was also fully removed by day 3, undergoing little change for the first day, but yielding a rate of 236 \muM/day between 2 and 3 days. \[^{15}\text{NO}_2^-\] enrichment showed an isotope dilution from 99 at\% to 19 at\% by the last sampling point when <2 \muM NO\(_2^-\) remained. Denitrification, anammox, and DNRA rates all increased in the presence of acetate, but the proportions of these reactions to each other differed relative to the #MI treatment. N\(_2\) production was observed beginning at 0.7 days post injection. Mass 29 and 30 enrichments were first measured at 2 days with mole fractions of 0.014 and 0.020 that increased to 0.088 and 0.103 by the end of the incubation (day 4). Anammox and denitrification rates (eq. 13, 14) were calculated as 24 and 555 nmoles-N/g sed/day respectively, with anammox responsible for 4\% of the total N\(_2\) production. A smaller amount of \[^{15}\text{N}\] tracer in NH\(_4^+\) was measured relative to #MI, albeit in 1/6 the amount of
incubation time, and enrichment reached a maximum of 218‰ (Figure 10). The calculated DNRA rate (eq. 15) was 3 nmol-N/g sed/day. DNRA accounted for <2% of the NO$_2^-$ loss in the CMI treatment.
F168 2013 Tracer

Figure 10. Results from the F168 tracer experiment. DIN concentrations and isotopes are shown in panels a-d. N$_2$ concentrations and mole fractions (MF) of isotopologues ($^{29}$N$_2$, $^{30}$N$_2$) are shown in panels e and f. No trace O$_2$ was measured at any timepoints.
DISCUSSION

Results from our natural abundance and tracer incubations yielded five findings: 1) denitrification and anammox co-occur in aquifer sediments, albeit at relatively low rates; 2) addition of labile organic carbon in the form of acetate shifts the denitrification/anammox ratio very strongly in favor of denitrification; 3) no distinguishable $\text{NO}_2^-$ or $\text{NO}_3^-$ isotope fractionation patterns could be discerned that were unique or diagnostic of specifically anammox or denitrification; 4) the use of $\delta^{15}\text{NH}_4^+$ as a diagnostic for anammox is potentially confounded by large $\text{NH}_4^+$ pool size and aqueous/sediment exchange; 5) isotope modeling demonstrates that the observed isotope dynamics can be achieved with or without anammox in conjunction with denitrification.

CO-OCCURRENCE OF DENITRIFICATION AND ANAMMOX

There are few reported anammox measurements in groundwater (Clark et al. 2008; Moore et al. 2011, Robertson et al. 2012). The rates of $\text{N}_2$ production observed here in the natural abundance incubations from the upper and lower plume, and the tracer-based rate measurements of denitrification and anammox in the lower plume, together indicated co-occurrence of both reactions. The rates measured in this study, which ranged between from 5.5-24 nmoles N/g sed/day for anammox and 19-555 nmoles N/g sed/day for denitrification, were comparable with other laboratory incubations of water and whole sediments collected from this site (Hyun et al. 2013), but 20-fold higher than in situ rates calculated following a $^{15}\text{NO}_2^-$ groundwater injection at this site (Smith et al. 2013). These incubation-derived rates relative to in situ were also faster than what would be predicted based upon modeled plume scale $\text{N}_2$
production during plume transport (Smith et al. 2004; Böhlke et al. 2006; Smith et al. 2013).

This apparent enhancement in the lab incubations could have been due to increased incubation temperature (20° C) relative in aquifer temperature (10° C), but even accounting for a typical factor of two enhancement of rates with a 10 degree shift in temperature (Q_{10} = 2) lab rates were still an order of magnitude greater. Instead, much of the enhancement was likely due to some degree of carbon mobilization from particles, not uncommon to slurry incubations (Smith et al. 2012). These observed rates, on the order of 1-88 nM-N/g/day for anammox and 19-1800 nM-N/g/day for denitrification, are nevertheless slow relative to analogous rates for processes in coastal and estuarine sediments (Dale et al. 2009), aquatic sediments (Dalsgaard et al. 2012), ice (Rysgaard and Glud 2004) and continental shelf sediments (Dalsgaard et al. 2005).

The faster overall total N\textsubscript{2} production observed at the upper plume relative to the lower plume was coincident with a higher observed denitrification at F575 (Smith et al. 2013). This faster rate, which was only moderately enhanced by the addition of acetate, was presumably enabled by a higher labile carbon abundance in the younger portion of the plume (Smith et al. 2012). In the lower plume, rates of anammox (28% of denitrification under no acetate conditions) were faster than the range predicted from ammonium transport model constraints that have been used to model $^{15}$NH\textsubscript{4}+ additions to the plume at this site (Böhlke et al. 2006). Anammox in lower plume sediments were within the range (13-1390 nmol/L/hr) of the few rates of anammox measured in groundwater, both lab rate (Moore et al. 2011) and \textit{in situ} (Robertson et al. 2012). The ratio of anammox to denitrification up to 28% in the lower plume (Figure 11) was above the median ratio reported for most surface water sedimentary systems and soils, in which anammox rates are typically less than 10% of total N\textsubscript{2} loss (Dalsgaard et al. 2005; Song
and Tobias 2011). The lack of labile carbon at the downgradient site may create conditions favoring anammox, as evidenced by the higher anammox to denitrification ratio seen.

**ORGANIC CARBON INDUCED SHIFT TO DENITRIFICATION**

The addition of acetate to incubation treatments was designed to permit comparison of isotope dynamics under conditions where anammox and denitrification approximated the ratio observed in the aquifer (nonacetate), in contrast to conditions that were heavily dominated by denitrification (+ acetate). Although anammox bacteria can reportedly use some carbon substrates, including acetate, (Nicholls and Trimmer 2009; Russ et al. 2012) the stimulation of anammox rates by acetate is insubstantial relative to the well-documented enhancement of denitrification by this carbon source (Dalsgaard et al. 2005; Ginige et al. 2005; Seitzinger et al. 2006).

Nonacetate treatments always proceeded at a slower rate than those of acetate treatments regardless of plume location. Increased electron supply allowed faster reaction rates with an enhanced effect on rates of NO₃⁻ reduction and N₂ production. (Figs 3-7). The greatest effect on rates of DIN drawdown and conversion to N₂ was seen in the lower plume sediments. Differences between treatments were particularly pronounced in the downgradient 2013 experiment, for which the nonacetate treatment exhibited only a small amount of N conversion to N₂ even after 93 days of incubation. With a large NH₄⁺ and NO₃⁻ background at this site, along with being in the core of the plume, this slow reaction rate may explain the persistence of the DIN load in the plume.

Denitrification is believed to terminate at N₂O in electron-limited environments (Seitzinger et al. 2006). While denitrification was occurring in all incubations, those that
included acetate showed less accumulation of N₂O relative those without acetate, indicating that the added carbon provided additional reducing power to push denitrification past N₂O in these low carbon sediments (Figure 3-7). The effect of acetate on the timing and accumulation of N₂O was most pronounced in the lower plume (F168) (Figure 5.a) which contains older and lower amounts of organic carbon groundwater and where in situ expression of the nitrous oxide reductase (nosZ) gene was very low (Song per. Com.). Direct validation of this acetate-induced denitrification was confirmed by the addition of ¹⁵N tracer to the F168 sediments which induced a shift from a denitrification : anammox (D:A) ratio of 72% in the absence of acetate (treatment “#MI”) to a D:A ratio of > 92% when acetate was added (treatment “CMI”) (Fig 11-12). This nonacetate ratio of D:A for F168 in the incubations was larger than the D:A measured in situ following a ¹⁵NO₂⁻ injection (D:A = 70:30), and may again indicate some degree of carbon mobilization from particles and enhanced carbon availability relative to in situ conditions (Smith et al. 2012). The smaller effect of acetate addition on the DIN dynamics in the upper plume (at all depths) where carbon is more abundant and labile (Smith et al. 2012) and D:A already high at 90% (Böhlke per. Com.) is further evidence that the acetate acted to increase denitrification relative to anammox, particularly in the lower plume. Collectively, these lines of evidence suggest that isotope enrichment factors and isotope dynamics in lower plume sediments should reflect a mixture of anammox and denitrification on the order of 1:3 in the nonacetate incubations, but almost exclusively denitrification in the acetate treatment. The isotope dynamics in the upper plume incubations should reflect the overwhelming influence of denitrification regardless of acetate treatment.
NO$_3$ ISOTOPES AS A DIAGNOSTIC OF ANAMMOX

$NO_x$ - The observed, or apparent, enrichment factors estimated from the Rayleigh plots (Figure 7-8) represent a composite of the fractional contributions and isotopic fractionations of all reactions that interact with the specific nitrogen species measured. Poor Rayleigh fits typically indicate several competing reactions either supplying or consuming a particular species and consisting of different enrichment factors. Good Rayleigh fits typically indicate either a dominance of one reaction affecting the concentration and isotopic composition of the pool, or, if there are multiple reactions – similar enrichment factors among them. The NO$_2^-$ and NO$_3^-$ Rayleigh plots (Figure 8-9, Table 2) showed good linear fits at both plume locations and under both acetate and nonacetate treatments. Only the F168 lower plume nonacetate treatments (#MI) yielded unique enrichment factors for NO$_3^-$ reduction to NO$_2^-$, and these two values were widely different. At -8 and -35‰, they are just outside of the range of isotope effects reported for denitrification (-13-30‰; Barford et al. 1999; Delwiche and Steyn 1970; and Granger et al. 2008) in pure culture, and in other groundwater denitrification experiments; Mariotti et al. 1981 (-24.6‰ - -29.8‰), Aravena and Robert 1998 (-22.9‰) measured under similar experimental conditions. The highly variable apparent isotope effect for NO$_3^-$ reduction measured in this study may indicate some isotopic disequilibrium between NO$_3^-$ and NO$_2^-$, particularly when reaction rates are low (F168 2013 #MI; Brunner et al. 2013). The apparent NO$_2^-$ reduction isotope effects measured in this study were within the greater third of enrichment factors reported for denitrification (-5-25‰; Mariotti et al. 1981; Bryan et al. 1983, epsilon Casciotti 2002). With the exception of the upper plume deep sediments (#MI) which yielded an isotope effect/enrichment factor equivalent to that reported for NO$_2^-$ reduction by a single anammox
culture (-16‰), all other measured NO$_2^-$ reduction enrichment factors were 3–10‰ larger than what would be expected currently from anammox (Brunner et al. 2013).

The smaller NO$_2^-$ reduction enrichment factors in the upper plume sediments versus lower plume sediments in the absence of acetate suggested a potential difference in the partitioning of different NO$_2^-$ reduction pathways (e.g. anammox and denitrification). However, the smaller enrichment factor was found in the upper plume, where there was a larger in situ D:A (Smith et al. 2012). Given a NO$_2^-$ reduction enrichment factor for anammox of -16‰; (Brunner et al. 2013), but a wider range of greater isotope effects for denitrification, a higher magnitude enrichment factor would have been expected at the larger D:A at the upper plume. Further, the addition of acetate, which forced both upper and lower plume incubations towards denitrification, did not yield significant shifts in the apparent isotope effects on NO$_2^-$ reduction relative to no acetate conditions in either sediment type. An explanation other than differential contributions of anammox and denitrification, must be responsible for the difference in apparent isotope effects in the upper and lower plumes in the absence of added carbon. Given the magnitudes of measured enrichment factors, the range of published values, and the lack of a clear shift in enrichment factors in the presence/absence of acetate, the NO$_2^-$ isotopes are not clearly diagnostic of a shift from anammox + denitrification to denitrification at either site.

**AMMONIUM ISOTOPES AS A DIAGNOSTIC**

Ammonium - The Rayleigh model could not be used to estimate effective enrichment factors for changing NH$_4^+$ in any of the incubations. The very poor fits (Fig 11) to all of the NH$_4^+$ and δ$^{15}$NH$_4^+$ data were initially thought to be attributable to two distinct phases of NH$_4^+$ processing: an initial aerobic ammonium oxidation phase when trace O$_2$ was present, and a
subsequent anaerobic NH$_4^+$ processing phase which would include anammox. All experiments showed initial small amount of NH$_4^+$ consumption, likely due to aerobic ammonium oxidation fueled by the trace O$_2$ entrained during incubation set up. Many of the incubations (Figure 4-6) showed concurrent transient rises in NO$_2^-$ and/or NO$_3^-$ during this period, and the pattern of $\delta^{15}$NO$_2^-$/ NO$_3^-$ at this time were consistent with aerobic ammonium oxidation. Upgradient, this initial NH$_4^+$ drawdown was followed by little change in NH$_4^+$ concentration. Downgradient with ambient NH$_4^+$ present, the drawdown was followed by a large fluctuation within a range of 100 μM. To deconstruct the effect of ammonium oxidation, we parsed the NH$_4^+$ data for each incubation into periods of >10 μM O$_2$ (where aerobic ammonium oxidation may dominate) and <10 μM O$_2$ (where the concentration and isotope effects of the oxidation would be inhibited). The differentiation showed the initial NH$_4^+$ concentration decrease and enrichment of $\delta^{15}$NH$_4^+$ (Figure 3-7) associated with the presence of trace oxygen. The separation only improved the fit of the Rayleigh curve sufficiently in two treatments to yield an enrichment factor estimate. This estimate, for the trace O$_2$ period, likely reflects aerobic ammonium oxidation though the fitted enrichment factors are small relative to those published for NH$_4^+$ $\rightarrow$ NO$_2^-$. This apparent dampening of the isotope effect is probably due to isotopic exchange of NH$_4^+$ between the aqueous and sediment fractions. With a large and exchangeable ammonium pool, low rates of any fractionating reaction (aerobic ammonium oxidation, anammox, etc.) would yield only small detectable isotopic changes in the sampled aqueous NH$_4^+$ fraction. Detection of this potentially small signal could be hampered by small fractionations associated with sorption/desorption reactions between the NH$_4^+$ (aqueous) and the NH$_4^+$ (sediment) (Böhlke et al. 2006). Any lags in reestablishing equilibrium between the isotopically light added NH$_4^+$ (4‰), the isotopically heavy in situ NH$_4^+$ (15‰) and fractionation reactions would be manifested as variability in the
measured aqueous $\delta^{15}$NH$_4^+$. It is possible that this factor is amplified in a laboratory setting relative to in situ where the timescale of sampling is short in comparison to groundwater transit times. This explanation could reconcile why a robust Rayleigh defined ammonium isotope effect for anammox is measurable in sediment free cultures (Brunner et al. 2013), and inferred on large spatial and temporal scales in aquifers (Clark et al. 2008), but not in our experimental set-up. A second possible explanation that DNRA contributed to poor NH$_4^+/\delta^{15}$NH$_4^+$ Rayleigh fits seems unlikely given that the results of the $^{15}$N tracer experiments showed DNRA was never more than 4% of the total NO$_2^-$ reduction.

**ISOTOPE MODELING**

The finite difference time-stepping isotope model was constructed with experimental tracer-derived rates and other reported enrichment factors as constraints on N reactions and ratios. It was designed to specifically illuminate three aspects of the results. First, to determine the enrichment factors for respective N reactions in the natural abundance incubations that represented a “best fit” for concentrations and $\delta^{15}$N evolution of NO$_2^-$, NO$_3^-$, NH$_4^+$, N$_2$ concentration and N$_2$O concentration. These reactions included: nitrate reduction (NO$_3^-$ $\rightarrow$ NO$_2^-$), denitrification (NO$_2^-$ $\rightarrow$ N$_2$O; N$_2$O $\rightarrow$ N$_2$), anammox (NO$_2^-$ $\rightarrow$ N$_2$; NH$_4^+$ $\rightarrow$ N2; NO$_2^-$ $\rightarrow$ NO$_3^-$), aerobic ammonium oxidation (NH$_4^+$ $\rightarrow$ NO$_2^-$), nitrification (NO$_2^-$ $\rightarrow$ NO$_3^-$) (also a side reaction of anammox), and dissimilatory nitrate/nitrite reduction to ammonium (NO$_2^-$ $\rightarrow$ NH$_4^+$). Second, to determine whether or not the weighting of denitrification in the acetate treatments necessitated significant changes in the enrichment factors in order to maintain good model fit. Third, to determine if the observed isotope dynamic could be achieved with reasonable
enrichment factors in the complete absence of anammox. This last task addressed directly whether a portion of the isotope dynamic was clearly indicative of anammox.

The model was initialized first using a range of enrichment factors as reported in Mariotti et al. 1981, Bartford et al. 1999, Casciotti 2002, Casciotti et al. 2003; Granger et al. 2008, and Casciotti 2009. Enrichment factors and rates are adjusted to yield optimum fits while remaining constrained by the range in the literature. The DNRA, denitrification, and anammox rates relative to each other were constrained by results from the tracer incubations. The range of acceptable D:A ratios was 0-0.5; the range of DNRA as a percentage of NO$_2^-$ reduction was 0-4%.

Model fits under “natural” (no acetate) conditions yielded similar parameters for both upgradient and downgradient sites. When parameters were set to achieve best model fits, enrichment factors ranged from -18-25‰ for all reactions. For the denitrification steps, including nitrate reduction (NO$_3^-$ $\rightarrow$ NO$_2^-$ $\rightarrow$ N$_2$O $\rightarrow$ N$_2$), enrichment factors were -20, -18, and -22‰. All of these values were within reported ranges, with the exception of N$_2$O$\rightarrow$ N$_2$ which was approximately 10‰ greater (Barford et al. 1999; Ostrom et al. 2007). For anammox, NO$_2^-$ $\rightarrow$ N$_2$ had an enrichment factor of -25‰, and NH$_4^+$ $\rightarrow$ N$_2$ generated an enrichment factor of -23‰. DNRA and aerobic ammonium oxidation were also found with enrichment factors of -20‰. Optimum A:D was 0.08, with the DNRA ratio to NO$_2^-$ reduction at 0.02. At the downgradient site, isotope effects ranged from -16-30‰. Denitrification steps had enrichment factors of -25, -25, and -30‰. For anammox, the NO$_2^-$ $\rightarrow$ N$_2$ reaction had an enrichment factor of -16‰, and the NH$_4^+$ $\rightarrow$ N$_2$ reaction had an enrichment factor of -23‰. DNRA was inactive for this model. Aerobic ammonium oxidation was at -20‰. A:D ratio was set at 0.18. All these enrichment factors in the nonacetate treatments were in range of those required for denitrification.
(Barford et al. 1999; Granger et al. 2008; Bryan et al. 1983; Casciotti et al. 2002; Mariotti et al. 1981). With the exception of $\text{N}_2\text{O} \rightarrow \text{N}_2$, whose modeled $\epsilon$ was ~10‰ greater than previously reported (Barford et al. 1999; Ostrom et al. 2007), all modeled isotope effects for denitrification in the upper and lower plume were within reported ranges (Barford et al. 1999; Granger et al. 2006; Casciotti et al. 2002). It was difficult to achieve good fits to the $\delta^{15}\text{N}_2$ data without the large $\text{N}_2\text{O} \rightarrow \text{N}_2$ enrichment factors, indicating that this higher fractionation in the final denitrification step is characteristic of the system. The isotope effects for anammox reactions ($\text{NO}_2^- \rightarrow \text{N}_2$ and $\text{NH}_4^+ \rightarrow \text{N}_2$) were largely consistent with the one published summary of anammox enrichment factors (Brunner et al. 2013). One greater modeled enrichment factor for $\text{NO}_2^- \rightarrow \text{N}_2$ in the upper plume (-25‰ versus a published -16‰) was relatively unimportant in the overall model. The model was sensitive to changes in denitrification parameters, but due to the low A:D ratio even in lower plume, changes in anammox reaction enrichment factors only moderately influenced overall model fit.
Figure 11. Best model fits to data from the 2012 upgradient nonacetate treatment. The anammox:denitrification ratio is located above the table, next to the rate of DNRA occurring proportional to them. In the table, the pathway is to the far left, with its reaction name beside it. Fractionation factors (α) are shown beside their corresponding enrichment factors (ε). In the plots, the points indicate experimental data from the treatment, and the smoothed line is generated from the model for a best fit.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pathway</th>
<th>Reaction Description</th>
<th>Rate (nM/h)</th>
<th>α</th>
<th>Enrichment Factor (ε)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NO₃→NO₂</td>
<td>Nitrate Reduction</td>
<td>0.03</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.980     20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO₂→NO₁</td>
<td>Denitrification I</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.982     18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO₃→N₂O₇</td>
<td>Anammox</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.975     25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO₃→N₂O₅</td>
<td>Anammox</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.030     -30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO₂→NH₃</td>
<td>DNRA</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.980     20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO₃→NO₂</td>
<td>Nitritation</td>
<td>0.03</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.012     -12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NH₄→NO₂</td>
<td>Aerobic Am Oxidation</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.980     20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*NH₄→N₂O₅</td>
<td>Anammox</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.977     23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N₂O→N₂</td>
<td>Denitrification II</td>
<td>0.38</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.978     22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 12. Best model fits to data from the 2012 downgradient nonacetate treatment. The anammox:denitrification ratio is located above the table, next to the rate of DNRA occurring proportional to them. In the table, the pathway is to the far left, with its reaction name beside it. Fractionation factors ($\alpha$) are shown beside their corresponding enrichment factors ($\varepsilon$). In the plots, the points indicate experimental data from the treatment, and the smoothed line is generated from the model for a best fit.
When acetate was added to shift the N₂ production to denitrification (minimizing anammox), similar fits could be achieved by adjusting denitrification rates and enrichment factors within a reasonable range for both upgradient and downgradient (Figures 13 and 14). NO₂⁻ concentration and isotopes continued to be dominated by denitrification. The fits for NO₃⁻ and ¹⁵NO₃⁻ were unaffected by presence or absence of the NO₂⁻ → NO₃⁻ reaction component of anammox. The influence of anammox on the NH₄⁺ isotopes was similarly negligible. The NH₄⁺ isotopes were largely governed by aerobic ammonium oxidation at the beginning of incubations, and isotope exchanges between aqueous and sediment ammonium. Even when the #MI treatments were modeled with anammox removed, good model fits could be attained. Similarly because DNRA had a small rate, it did not play a significant role in model fitting for either NO₂⁻ or NH₄⁺ at any site for any treatment.
Figure 13. Best model fits to data from the 2012 upgradient acetate treatment. The anammox:denitrification ratio is located above the table, next to the rate of DNRA occurring proportional to them. In the table, the pathway is to the far left, with its reaction name beside it. Fractionation factors ($\alpha$) are shown beside their corresponding enrichment factors ($\varepsilon$). In the plots, the points indicate experimental data from the treatment, and the smoothed line is generated from the model for a best fit.
Figure 14. Best model fits to data from the 2012 downgradient acetate treatment. The anammox:denitrification ratio is located above the table, next to the rate of DNRA occurring proportional to them. In the table, the pathway is to the far left, with its reaction name beside it. Fractionation factors ($\alpha$) are shown beside their corresponding enrichment factors ($\varepsilon$). In the plots, the points indicate experimental data from the treatment, and the smoothed line is generated from the model for a best fit.
SUMMARY

While a signal for anammox can be detected and confirmed through tracer experiments, we were unable to establish a clear isotopic diagnostic for any DIN species that would be indicative of anammox under conditions where denitrification co-occurs. In the Cape Cod plume, there was a sufficient fractionation overlap between denitrification and anammox reactions involving shared oxidized N pools to preclude distinction between $^{15}$NO$_x$ isotopes. Use of the $\delta^{15}$NH$_4^+$ pool was hampered by a combination of low rates of NH$_4^+$ use by anammox and variable amounts of NH$_4^+$ isotope exchanges between aqueous and sediment fractions. It is possible that the dampening of the anammox isotope effect caused by these exchanges may diminish on plume transport scales. On these extended time scales, low anammox rates could remove enough total NH$_4^+$ enough to potentially detect an anammox fractionation in the NH$_4^+$ pool (Clark et al. 2008). However, the chromatographic and isotope homogenization effect of these isotope exchanges should be carefully considered when using in situ patterns of $\delta^{15}$NH$_4^+$ to infer anammox.
REFERENCES


65


69


Song, BK, et al. 2010. Molecular and Stable Isotope Investigation of Nitrite Respiring Bacterial Communities Capable of Anaerobic Ammonium Oxidation (ANAMMOX) and Denitrifying Anaerobic Methane Oxidation (DAMO) in Nitrogen Contaminated Groundwater. *American Geophysical Union, Fall Meeting 2010*. Abstract #B51B-0349


Swartz, CH, et al. 2006. Steroid Estrogens, Nonylphenol Ethoxylate Metabolites, and Other Wastewater Contaminants in Groundwater Affected by a Residential Septic System on Cape Cod, MA. *Environmental Science and Technology*. **40** (16): 4894-4902


